

Summary Judgment May Not Be Appropriate for Determining Reasonable Notice

April 2, 2019

Trials are too expensive for many litigants. Summary judgment is one way of resolving disputes without a trial. In Alberta, summary judgment is available at any time during the pre-trial process. The advantages of summary judgment are not only that it avoids a trial, but in many cases it also avoids the full expense and delay of pre-trial procedures. Based on a recent decision from the Court of Queen's Bench of Alberta, however, summary judgment may not be appropriate for determining reasonable notice in a wrongful dismissal case.

In a normal wrongful dismissal case where there is no allegation of cause for the termination of employment, the main issue to be determined is the amount of notice, or pay in lieu of notice, that the employee is entitled to. In most cases, the court will consider the classic factors that were set out in *Bardal v. Globe & Mail Ltd.*, 1960 CanLII 294 (*Bardal*), as well as other factors depending on the circumstances of the particular case. In determining the reasonable notice, the court must decide which factors should be given greater weight depending on the particular case.

Background

In *Coffey v. Nine Energy Inc.*, 2017 ABQB 417 (*Coffey*), the plaintiff sought summary judgment against his former employer. The defendant did not allege cause in his termination, but defended the action by disputing the appropriate notice period and the plaintiff's claim for compensation.

On appeal from a master's decision, Justice Nixon of the Court of Queen's Bench reviewed the leading authorities, such as *Bardal*, and determined that the assessment of "reasonable notice involves the weighing of evidence, and is not a simple mechanical application of legal principles to established facts" or a "simple computation". The Court concluded that an assessment of damages for pay in lieu of reasonable notice is not appropriate for summary judgment as it involves the determination of contentious issues of fact that requires the court to weigh evidence which is outside the scope of the summary judgment.

Takeaway

While summary judgment should be used when it is the proportionate, more expeditious, and less expensive procedure, summary judgment applications seeking an assessment of damages in wrongful dismissal cases will not likely be successful based on the decision in *Coffey*. However, there are other options available to the plaintiff to avoid a trial. The Court in *Coffey* held that a summary trial, rather than summary judgment, may be appropriate for determining reasonable notice as it allows the Court to weigh competing evidence and avoids an expensive full, *viva voce* trial.¹

¹ Note that the Court of Appeal of Alberta in *Weir-Jones Technical Services Incorporated v Purolator Courier Ltd*, 2019 ABCA 49 recently clarified the test for summary judgment.

AUTHOR

Andrew Pozzobon
T 403.232.9520
APozzobon@blg.com

BLG OFFICES

Calgary

Centennial Place, East Tower
520 3rd Avenue S.W.
Calgary, AB, Canada
T2P 0R3

T +1.403.232.9500
F +1.403.266.1395

Montréal

1000 De La Gauchetière Street West
Suite 900
Montréal, QC, Canada
H3B 5H4

T +1.514.954.2555
F +1.514.879.9015

Ottawa

World Exchange Plaza
100 Queen Street
Ottawa, ON, Canada
K1P 1J9

T +1.613.237.5160
F +1.613.230.8842

Toronto

Bay Adelaide Centre, East Tower
22 Adelaide Street West
Toronto, ON, Canada
M5H 4E3

T 416.367.6000
F 416.367.6749

Vancouver

1200 Waterfront Centre
200 Burrard Street
Vancouver, BC, Canada
V7X 1T2

T 604.687.5744
F 604.687.1415

The information contained herein is of a general nature and is not intended to constitute legal advice, a complete statement of the law, or an opinion on any subject. No one should act upon it or refrain from acting without a thorough examination of the law after the facts of a specific situation are considered. You are urged to consult your legal adviser in cases of specific questions or concerns. BLG does not warrant or guarantee the accuracy, currency or completeness of this publication. No part of this publication may be reproduced without prior written permission of Borden Ladner Gervais LLP. If this publication was sent to you by BLG and you do not wish to receive further publications from BLG, you may ask to remove your contact information from our mailing lists by emailing unsubscribe@blg.com or manage your subscription preferences at blg.com/MyPreferences. If you feel you have received this message in error please contact communications@blg.com. BLG's privacy policy for publications may be found at blg.com/en/privacy.

© 2019 Borden Ladner Gervais LLP. Borden Ladner Gervais LLP is an Ontario Limited Liability Partnership.