

Court emphasizes systems of maintenance in occupiers' liability claims

May 13, 2022

On April 8, 2022, the Ontario Superior Court of Justice released its decision in [Martin v. AGO et al, 2022 ONSC 1923](#). This decision is a helpful refresher on occupiers' liability claims in Ontario, with a particular focus on what steps an occupier and/or its contractors can take to meet the standard of care pursuant to section 3(1) of the Occupiers' Liability Act.

Background

The plaintiff, a criminal defence lawyer, attended the John Sopinka Courthouse in Hamilton around 11:30 AM on July 14, 2015, slipping on a "small amount of water" and tearing his hamstring in a main public hallway. The quantum of damages was agreed upon in advance of trial, but liability and contributory negligence remained at issue. The defendants by the time of trial were the owner and property manager of the courthouse, along with a building maintenance company, which had been contracted to provide janitorial services.

The parties submitted an extensive statement of facts at trial, aided by the existence of CCTV footage depicting the fall. Notably, it was agreed that it had rained on the morning of the fall, and the water that caused the fall had accumulated from the wet umbrella of a courthouse visitor.

The trial decision

The court dismissed the plaintiff's claim, finding that the defendants had met the standard of care set out at section 3(1) of the Occupiers' Liability Act, namely "to take such care as in all the circumstances of the case is reasonable to see that persons entering on the premises... are reasonably safe while on the premises."

The court found that mats had been placed on the date of loss inside all three entrances to the courthouse, such that no one could enter without walking over one of them. In addition, six wet floor signs were placed throughout the premises, including one that was visible to the plaintiff as he traversed the hallway where he eventually fell. Finally, the contractor's site staff included a full-time day porter whose duties included at least

four floor inspections per day on each of the courthouse’s seven public floors, along with a work order system of responding to complaints. On this basis, the court held that the defendants had provided a robust system of inspection and maintenance that met the standard of care in the circumstances, which is not a standard of perfection.

Moreover, the court found that the water on which the plaintiff slipped was approximately the amount that would be generated by a single ice cube. The court noted that the amount was “not perceptible” by at least six people. Accordingly, the plaintiff failed to establish that “but for” the defendants adopting a more vigilant system of surveillance, the accident would have been prevented. Finally, the court would have assessed the plaintiff with 30 per cent contributory negligence if successful, due to the worn out soles of his shoes.

Commentary

This decision highlights the centrality of systems of maintenance and inspection for occupiers of premises and their contractors. While fact-driven, the decision also reminds plaintiffs that they are not automatically entitled to compensation simply because they are injured on someone else’s property, as occupiers are not insurers for slip-and-falls.

By

[Natalie D. Kolos](#), [Aidan Fishman](#)

Expertise

[Disputes](#), [Municipal Liability](#), [Insurance Claim Defence](#)

BLG | Canada’s Law Firm

As the largest, truly full-service Canadian law firm, Borden Ladner Gervais LLP (BLG) delivers practical legal advice for domestic and international clients across more practices and industries than any Canadian firm. With over 725 lawyers, intellectual property agents and other professionals, BLG serves the legal needs of businesses and institutions across Canada and beyond – from M&A and capital markets, to disputes, financing, and trademark & patent registration.

blg.com

BLG Offices

Calgary

Centennial Place, East Tower
520 3rd Avenue S.W.
Calgary, AB, Canada
T2P 0R3

T 403.232.9500
F 403.266.1395

Ottawa

World Exchange Plaza
100 Queen Street
Ottawa, ON, Canada
K1P 1J9

T 613.237.5160
F 613.230.8842

Vancouver

1200 Waterfront Centre
200 Burrard Street
Vancouver, BC, Canada
V7X 1T2

T 604.687.5744
F 604.687.1415

Montréal

1000 De La Gauchetière Street West
Suite 900
Montréal, QC, Canada
H3B 5H4

T 514.954.2555
F 514.879.9015

Toronto

Bay Adelaide Centre, East Tower
22 Adelaide Street West
Toronto, ON, Canada
M5H 4E3

T 416.367.6000
F 416.367.6749

The information contained herein is of a general nature and is not intended to constitute legal advice, a complete statement of the law, or an opinion on any subject. No one should act upon it or refrain from acting without a thorough examination of the law after the facts of a specific situation are considered. You are urged to consult your legal adviser in cases of specific questions or concerns. BLG does not warrant or guarantee the accuracy, currency or completeness of this publication. No part of this publication may be reproduced without prior written permission of Borden Ladner Gervais LLP. If this publication was sent to you by BLG and you do not wish to receive further publications from BLG, you may ask to remove your contact information from our mailing lists by emailing unsubscribe@blg.com or manage your subscription preferences at blg.com/MyPreferences. If you feel you have received this message in error please contact communications@blg.com. BLG's privacy policy for publications may be found at blg.com/en/privacy.

© 2024 Borden Ladner Gervais LLP. Borden Ladner Gervais LLP is an Ontario Limited Liability Partnership.